APPENDIX 9: METHODOLOGY CHECKLISTS[1]

Template for Methodology Checklist **2**

Interventions to improve service user experience **3**

CHAUDHURY2005 3
COULTER2006 4
DEVLIN2003 5
DUNCAN2010 6
HAMANN2003 7
KINNERSLEY2007 8
LEWIN2001 9
MURRAY2005 10
NICOLSON2009 11
OCONNOR2009 12
PARRY2008 13
PITKETHLY2008 14
REEVES2008 15
SHEPPERD2010 16
WETZELS2007 17
ZWARENSTEIN2009 18

[1] Further information about each study, including references can be found in Appendix 8.

TEMPLATE FOR METHODOLOGY CHECKLIST

Study identification	
Guideline topic:	
Checklist completed by:	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	***Chose one option for each question***
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes/No/Unclear
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes/No/Unclear
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes/No/Unclear
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes/No/Unclear
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes/No/Unclear

REVIEWS OF INTERVENTIONS TO IMPROVE SERVICE USER EXPERIENCE

Study identification	**CHAUDHURY2005**
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	***Chose one option for each question***
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Review synthesises evidence in three areas: (1) cost, (2) infection control, (3) therapeutic impact. The third area is the only one that is directly relevant to the review question. Cross-sectional and intervention studies are reviewed narratively.
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	No
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	**COULTER2006**
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	***Chose one option for each question***
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Partial
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	**DEVLIN2003**
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	***Chose one option for each question***
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes – section headed "Patient-Centred Care" is most relevant
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	No
Study quality is assessed and reported	No
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	No

Study identification	**DUNCAN2010**
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	***Chose one option for each question***
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	**HAMANN2003**
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Craig Whittington	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	***Chose one option for each question***
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	No (only Medline and cross-referencing used)
Study quality is assessed and reported	No (no formal assessment is reported, but strength of results is described)
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	**KINNERSLEY2007**
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	***Chose one option for each question***
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	**LEWIN2001**
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	***Chose one option for each question***
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	**MURRAY2005**
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	***Chose one option for each question***
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	**NICOLSON2009**
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	***Chose one option for each question***
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	**OCONNOR2009**
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	***Chose one option for each question***
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	**PARRY2008**
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	***Chose one option for each question***
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes – part one of review only (however only one study assesses patient outcomes, the remaining four studies assess clinicians' performance).
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	**PITKETHLY2008**
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	***Chose one option for each question***
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	**REEVES2008**
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	***Chose one option for each question***
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	**SHEPPERD2010**
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	***Chose one option for each question***
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	**WETZELS2007**
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	***Chose one option for each question***
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	**ZWARENSTEIN2009**
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	***Chose one option for each question***
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	No studies were found that included service user experience of care outcomes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	No – EMBASE and PsycINFO not searched
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes